

**REMUNERATION COMMITTEE  
MEETING HELD ON 21<sup>ST</sup> JULY 2023 VIA MS TEAMS**

**APPROVED MINUTES**

<b>Members</b>		<b>Meeting 1 08.11.22</b>	<b>Meeting 2 22.03.23</b>	<b>Meeting 3 21.07.23</b>
Independent Members of Council	Kru Desai	A	✓	✓
	Catherine McGuinness	✓	✓	✓
	Julia Palca	✓	✓	✓
	Jen Tippin (Chair)	✓	✓	✓

**Key:**    ✓    In Attendance        A    Apologies given        P    Part Attendance  
   NM    Not a Member

<b>In Attendance</b>	<b>Reason and Meeting Section</b>
Dr William Jordan	University Secretary
Katharyn Kingwill	Governance Officer
Mark Gardner	Deputy HR Director
Maggie Reid	Reward Manager
Peter Smith	Director, Public Sector Practice, KornFerry Hay Group
Professor Sir Anthony Finkelstein	President (partial attendance for items 3-12)

**MINUTES SECTION A – OPEN FOR PUBLICATION**

Prior to the meeting, there was a short informal meeting of the Independent Members of the Committee which was not minuted.

**Part One – Preliminary Items**

**1. Items for Starring**

The Committee agreed the starring of all items on the agenda. RemCo welcomed the Deputy Director of HR to the meeting.

**2. Minutes**

The Committee approved the minutes of the meetings held on 22<sup>nd</sup> March 2023. The open section of the meeting would be published on the City website in due course.

*The President, the Deputy HR Director, the Reward Manager and the RemCo Advisor, Peter Smith, joined the meeting at this point.*

**3. Matters Arising**

RemCo noted the matters arising.

**4. Conflicts of Interest**

There were no declared conflicts of interest from members.

The President declared an interest in any discussion of Head of Institution (HoI) remuneration and pension arrangements. The President and executives in attendance left the meeting for items as noted in the minutes.

**5. Items Specially Brought Forward by the Chair**

There were no items brought forward by the Chair.

## 6. Remuneration Committee Calendar 2023/24

The Committee noted the list of future items.

### **Part Two – Strategic Items – President and executives in attendance**

## 7. Sectoral Developments Update

Peter Smith provided an update on emerging trends in the sector along with two reports, the *2023 Higher Education Pay Survey* and an analysis of the gender pay gap in 47 pre-92 universities, making the following points:

- The Higher Education Pay Survey was an annual report of City's remuneration against all 24 members of the Russell Group; it had been run for 10 years so the resulting dataset provided useful trend analysis. The report was accompanied by an analysis toolkit to facilitate benchmarking.
- The report highlighted issues for City to consider: Grade 4 professors, and subject areas below the group average such as Economics, Econometrics and Music. The President would be considering with colleagues the underlying data for areas with lower than average pay, and report back to RemCo in due course.

### **[Action]**

- Some of the subject areas identified in the report had low NSS scores but there was not necessarily a direct link as this was an issue with multiple contributing factors. But this could be explored further in City subject areas such as Economics.
- The sector was generally quiet with regard to remuneration matters except for the ongoing industrial action.
- Queens University Belfast had left UCEA following a breach of the collective agreement.
- In respect of gender pay it continued to be the case that fewer women were promoted to professor level, resulting in 75% of professors being male, a trend unchanged in the past decade. There was a similar trend in ethnicity data resulting in the majority of professorial staff being white males.
- As part of actions to address this imbalance, the President had led a review and revision of the Academic Promotions Policy criteria to allow a broader range of candidates to progress to professor; it was hoped that this would have a positive effect on the gender balance at City.
- The combination with St George's would impact on equality data and professorial pay levels, which might be positive for the combined institution, however this could depend on how pay data for health professionals was defined, as it could derive from both the NHS and from the educational institution.
- RemCo thanked Peter Smith for the report.

## 8. Equal Pay Audit

RemCo received an update on Equal Pay issues at City. Data Modelling confirmed that the most effective means to address academic equal pay was to increase the number of women and minority groups in professorial bands 3 and 4. A number of measures were now in train, for example, the review of the Academic Promotion policy as noted above. At the other end of the scale City was working to engage male students as student ambassadors. Starting salary guidance had been reviewed to remove the emphasis on salaries matching current remuneration and starting salary at the lowest increment for that pay band; it was hoped that this would provide more flexibility. City would also be mindful that rezoning and re-banding of professors in Bayes could have a negative impact on the gender pay gap. In discussion the following points were made:

- There were challenges in recruitment, particularly in competitive areas and renegotiation of salary on appointment was more common than before which slowed down the process.

- HR was also working on the Employee Value Proposition so that the full benefits of working at City were clear to applicants.

## 9. Responsibility Allowances Update

RemCo received an update on ongoing discussions within City regarding responsibility allowances. In discussion the following points were made:

- Currently the award of RAs in the Business School included payments for tasks that were outside the scope of RAs in other Schools. In due course these RAs should cease to be offered so that only core roles of Heads of Department and Associate Deans should be in receipt of RAs, standardised across the University. But the transition would be complex and it was important to try to minimise individual detriment in this process.
- One solution could be to review pay against the market which may mitigate changes in RA payments.
- Innovation in automation could reduce tasks associated with roles and therefore lessen the requirement for additional pay.
- The President would review progress with the Director of HR and report to the meeting in November with more detail and a suggested timeline for action.  
[Action]
- The Due Diligence would cover the use of RAs at St George's.

## 10. Draft Annual Remuneration Report

RemCo noted the draft Remuneration Report for the financial year 2022/23 which would be approved by Council on 24<sup>th</sup> November as part of the Annual Report and Accounts. Details of the President's remuneration from external sources would be added to the report prior to the November submission.

RemCo endorsed the format for the report.

*Peter Smith left the meeting at this point.*

## **Part Three – Higher Paid and Senior Staff – issues requiring attendance of President**

## 11. Senior Staff Reporting to the President

### 11.1 Achievement of Objectives

RemCo received reports on achievement of objectives for 13 members of Senior Staff reporting to the President and the Chief Operating Officer. Reports for two members of SLT would come to the next meeting. In discussion the following points were noted:

- RemCo commented that the format of reporting from Actus did not work well for the purposes of reporting on performance to the committee as although it was helpful to have visibility on individual objectives it was not possible to get a sense of performance of the team as a whole and how this aligned with the strategic objectives. Remco would also welcome commentary on the skills mix in the team and potential for growth and development.
- The President had met all members of SLT to discuss performance and principal objectives therefore he would circulate a narrative of these discussions to RemCo.  
[Action]
- RemCo suggested that sustainability objectives could be linked to the OfS initiative asking universities to audit their plans for Net Zero. All members of SLT did have EDI objectives; in addition, they undertook roles relating to particular areas of City's performance.

### 11.2 Base Pay Review for Members of Senior Staff

RemCo noted that the President did not propose to make any recommendations for discretionary increases to base pay for Senior Staff reporting to the President, Deputy President or COO. All members of staff, with the exception of the President, would however receive the cost of living adjustment agreed by JNCHES.

## **12. Recognition Award Scheme**

RemCo noted that it would be unlikely that the President or the Chair of Council would bring forward any nominations under the Recognition Award Scheme to the November meeting in relation to the previous academic year for members of Senior Staff.

*The President left the meeting at this point and was not present for discussion of the following items. The University Secretary also left the meeting at this point and was not present for part of the discussion of item 13 pertaining to his role.*

### **Part Four – Higher Paid and Senior Staff – issues not requiring attendance of President**

## **13. Higher Paid Staff ie staff earning more than £100k per annum**

### **13.1 Achievement of Objectives**

RemCo noted reports on achievement of objectives for 2022/23 and objectives set for 2023/24 for two members of Senior Staff reporting to the Chair of Council, the President and the University Secretary, and the Director of Internal Audit, reporting to the University Secretary.

*This item is continued in Section B of the minutes, Closed Business.*

### **13.2 Head of Institution Remuneration**

RemCo noted the report on the President's remuneration in the context of recent CUC data on Head of Institutions' remuneration. In discussion it was noted that this year's data was more complete and was based on CUC data with some cross-referencing to UCEA datasets.

### **13.3 Base Pay Review for Members of Senior Staff reporting to the Chair of Council**

RemCo noted that the Chair of Council did not propose to make any recommendations for increases to base pay for Senior Staff reporting to them.

### **14.1 Appointments and Departures**

RemCo noted one new appointment and the departure of three members of staff within its remit. In discussion the following point was made:

- Council would not be required to report one departure as a severance payment as this was a resignation with payment limited to period of notice.

*This item is continued in Section B of the minutes, Closed Business.*

### **14.2 Approvals by Circulation**

RemCo noted its approvals by circulation, for the period between 13<sup>th</sup> March and 12<sup>th</sup> July, for seven members of staff.

*This item is continued in Section B of the minutes, Closed Business.*

### **14.3 Business Cases for Responsibility Allowances**

RemCo considered business cases for proposed responsibility allowances for three members of Higher Paid Staff. The first case was a temporary responsibility allowance for a member of staff in SHPS who would take on additional responsibilities in relation to the merger with St George's. Two cases were for responsibility allowances for course director roles in Bayes. In discussion the following points were made:

- The case raised a key question around staff capacity and the extra tasks required relating to the merger and how this was to be addressed in the University, so care should be taken with regard to business cases of this nature as there could be a number of cases as the project progressed.
- It might be preferable to increase support staff who would be working on the merger, rather than to increase the workload for individuals. The additional costs of staffing resource should be considered part of the merger costs and therefore accounted for on a separate basis from ongoing staffing costs.

- RemCo would not consider it would be unreasonable to develop a case for a retention payment for this individual who held key institutional knowledge; but would wish to see further information on this and further consideration of the time period for the payment before agreeing a way forward in this case. **[Action]**  
[Secretary's note: the revised business case as a retention payment was approved by circulation]
- The business cases for Responsibility Allowances for two members of senior staff in Bayes who were taking on course director roles were straightforward and in line with current practice in the School.

### **Decisions**

RemCo **approved** business cases for proposed responsibility allowances for two members of Higher Paid Staff and requested further consideration of one case.

*This item is continued in Section B of the minutes, Closed Business.*

### **14.4 Exceptional Requests**

RemCo noted cases that it might be asked to approve via circulation.

*This item is continued in Section B of the minutes, Closed Business.*

### **Part Five – Items for Information**

#### **15. Ethnicity Pay Gap Report 2022**

Noted for information.

#### **16. AOB and Date of Next Meeting**

The Chair of Council thanked Jen Tippin for her contribution to City as Chair of RemCo and as a member of Council during her period of office. Her experience was invaluable and she would be very much missed.

The next meeting would take place on 8<sup>th</sup> November 2023 at 2pm.

Jen Tippin  
Remuneration Committee Chair  
July 2023