COUNCIL
MEETING HELD ON 8th May 2015
APPROVED MINUTES

Members

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Meeting 1</th>
<th>Meeting 2</th>
<th>Meeting 3</th>
<th>Meeting 4</th>
<th>Meeting 5</th>
<th>Meeting 6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.10.14</td>
<td>28.11.14</td>
<td>06.02.15</td>
<td>20.03.15</td>
<td>08.05.15</td>
<td>10.07.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Officers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Rob Woodward (Pro-Chancellor)</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Roger Bright (Deputy Pro-Chancellor)</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor Paul Curran (Vice-Chancellor)</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sir Brendan Barber</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dame Lynne Brindley</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor Sir Drummond Bone</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>NM</td>
<td>NM</td>
<td>NM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Andy Friend</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor Iain Gray</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Andrew Halper</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Adrian Haxby</td>
<td>NM</td>
<td>NM</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Nicola Hodson</td>
<td>NM</td>
<td>NM</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Philippa Hird</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr John Low</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Kieran Murphy</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Hunada Nouss</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Carolyn Regan</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff &amp; Student Members</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Rima Amin</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Stephen Avery</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor David Bolton</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor Steve Haberman</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Mary Luckiram</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor Stanton Newman</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key: ✓ In Attendance  A Apologies  P Part Attendance  NM Not a Member  S Sabbatical

In Attendance: Reason and Meeting Section

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In Attendance</th>
<th>Reason and Meeting Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr James Bryan</td>
<td>Head of Organisational Development, Human Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor John Fothergill</td>
<td>Pro Vice-Chancellor (Research &amp; Enterprise) (PVC (R&amp;E))</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mrs Yemi Gbajobi</td>
<td>CEO of Students’ Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Sarah Lawton</td>
<td>Governance Administrator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Frank Toop</td>
<td>University Secretary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor Richard Verrall</td>
<td>Pro Vice-Chancellor (Strategy &amp; Planning) (PVC (S&amp;P))</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MINUTES SECTION A – OPEN FOR PUBLICATION

Part One – Preliminary Items

1. Highlighted Items

Council agreed the highlighted items.

Item 10 would be deferred to the next meeting as Professor Newman, PVC (International) was unable to attend due to ill health.
2. **Minutes**  
The minutes of the meeting held on 20\textsuperscript{th} March 2015 were **approved**.

3. **Matters Arising**  
Council noted the table of actions arising from past meetings. The following was noted:

- **Action 3, Minute 9.5, 22.11.13**, the action regarding the Internationalisation Strategy to 2016 would be deferred to the July meeting of Council as the PVC (International) had been unable to attend.
- **Action 6, Minute 9.2, 11.07.14**, Council agreed to remove the action regarding the Financial Forecasts as this would be incorporated in staff engagement with the Vision & Strategy 2026.
- **Action 10, Minute 11.1, 28.11.14**, Council agreed to remove the action regarding the Culture Working Group as this had been overtaken by the Organisational Development Framework.

4. **Conflicts of Interest**  
Council agreed that Members would indicate any conflicts of interest at the time of the item to which those conflicts pertained.

5. **Items Specially Brought Forward by the Chair**  
Council thanked Rima Amin, President of the Students' Union, who was attending her last meeting as her term as President ends at 30th June 2015. She thanked Council and noted that the mentoring arrangement with a member of Council had proved very useful.

The Chair informed members that Mary Luckiram was now convalescing at home and wished her well on behalf of Council.

It was noted that in addition to the bound papers Council had also received separately the Strategy, Implementation and Performance Committee minutes from 23\textsuperscript{rd} April, the Remuneration Committee minutes from 29\textsuperscript{th} April (members only) and the Senate highlights from its meeting on 6\textsuperscript{th} May. The President of the local UCU branch had also handed members a leaflet on entry to the meeting entitled “The Real Picture at City University”.

The Chair had attended the CUC Spring Plenary on “Supporting Student Success” and noted that the attendance rate was increasing, demonstrating the importance Chairs are placing on the value added by the CUC. Two main themes arose, firstly the Government’s view of the Sector as cash rich, which was concerning as that represented an historic picture and secondly that the pay and reward of Vice-Chancellors and Senior University staff should be better controlled.

The Chair noted that there continued to be a split in the HE Sector with an alternative Code of Governance in Scotland and with legislation proposed which might lead to the Chair of the Council being decided by a democratic process, open to both staff and students.

The Chair thanked all those who had been involved in the recruitment process for the appointment of a new University Secretary.
**Decision**

Council approved the appointment of Dr William Jordan, a former senior Civil Servant in the Cabinet Office to succeed Frank Toop as University Secretary on Frank’s retirement.

The Chair reminded members that the annual appraisal email had been circulated and dates would be agreed for him to meet each member.

The Chair congratulated the Vice-Chancellor and his Executive Team for the success of the Chancellor’s Dinner held on 22nd April at the Mansion House and noted the quality of the occasion, guests and discussion.

6. **Council Calendar**

Council noted the rolling Council Calendar and the following points were noted:

- The Plenary dinner scheduled for the 9th July would be used as an event to acknowledge the contribution of the University Secretary, Frank Toop, who would retire at the end of July and Council Members; Andrew Halper, Kieran Murphy and Carolyn Regan whose terms of office would end at the end of July. Also the President of the Students’ Union, Rima Amin. Some non-Council Members have been invited including The Hon Apurv Bagri, former Chair of Council.
- The Chair’s dinner scheduled for the 8th October would become a Council Plenary Dinner.

7. **Vice-Chancellor’s Report**

The Vice-Chancellor highlighted several items from his report. In discussion the following points were noted:

- The University of London (UoL) had established a Review Panel to advise it and the Panel will visit City in June 2015. The Vice-Chancellor and the Pro-Chancellor had exercised their delegated powers and submitted a discussion document to UoL. Members of Council received a copy of the discussion document at this Council meeting.
- Cass Business School had recently had its Association to Advance Collegiate Schools of Business (AACSB) continuous improvement review and its accreditation was extended for another 5 years.
- Professor Marianne Lewis from *University of Cincinnati Carl H. Lindner College of Business* had been appointed as the new Dean of Cass Business School. She would join on the 1st September as Dean-elect and take up her post as Dean on the 1st November 2015. Council took the opportunity to thank Professor Steve Haberman for all his work as Dean.
- Unitemps was on target to exceed budget projections with a turnover of more that £2M this financial year. It had arranged 1,675 new individual assignments since January with a further 283 people finding work via the service in 2015. 73% of the roles were taken by current students and recent graduates, a quarter of whom were international students.
- Dr Karen Shaw would take up the post of Director of Research and Enterprise on 1st June and would be a member of the Executive Committee.
- A University-wide plan to strengthen and increase consultancy was progressing. Consultancy had continued to increase, with 2014/15 income of £2.1M reported on 31st March.
- The largest component of City’s Enterprise income is from Continuing Professional Development (CPD). To date, City’s CPD and short courses income for 2014/15 was £4.97M. Cass Business School had generated £2.79M so far, followed by City short courses with £1.45M. A full report would be available later in the year.
• The Athena SWAN application had not been successful and the University would increase its efforts to gain accreditation.
• The annual HEFCE letter had been received. The University was “not at higher risk” and the expressed concerns of HEFCE had been reduced significantly. The letter would come to the next ARC and Council. HEFCE had audited the University’s annual Higher Education-Business Community Interaction Survey and gained satisfactory assurance.
• The work led by the Dean of the School of Mathematics, Computer Science & Engineering to consider the strategic options for the School.
• The Vice-Chancellor highlighted some of the potential political risks following the election: the EU referendum, the future of BIS, the visa rules, and a possible review (similar to the REF) for education. He noted that the Chancellor of the Exchequer saw investment in science as essential for economic growth.
• Dr John Low, had attended Senate as an observer on 6th May and noted that he was impressed with the approach taken by the University in dealing with academic quality and standards. He recommended other Independent Council members consider attending future Senate meetings.
• One member raised the issue of staff membership on Council raised in the UCU branch leaflet and it was agreed that this should be considered by Corporate Governance and Nominations Committee. [Action]

8. President of the Students’ Union Report
The President gave a verbal report and the following points were noted:
• The Governance and Services Review had been put on hold until the new CEO, Yemi Gbajobi was in post and it had now resumed.
• The “Keep Calm and Study On” campaign to support students during the exams period, including the popular live petting zoo.
• All complaints except one made to Accreditation Network UK (ANUK) were upheld by the Tribunal in respect of Pure City student accommodation. The CFO confirmed that a report on the Pure City student accommodation issue would be presented to ARC at its meeting in June. He also attributed the successful outcome at the Tribunal to the SU President’s determination.
• The Union was preparing a paper for UET to ask that Friday prayers be held on campus following a unanimous vote in favour at the Union AGM.
• Over 500 nominations were received for staff and programme representatives from across the institution for the very successful Student Voice Awards.
• The Students’ Union was working with the University to create a Sexual Harassment Policy.
• The Student Union Activity Awards had taken place at the Islington Assembly Hall for the first time ever and was attended by the CFO, Stephen Avery. The SU considered it to be one of the highlight events of the year. One member questioned whether the Governance Review would look at the Students’ Union funding levels, the SU President confirmed that there were many areas in need of development which would require extra funding and this would be addressed under the Services Review.

Decision
At the suggestion of the Chair, the next meeting of the Corporate Governance and Nominations Committee would consider approving a proposal to amend the composition of SIPCo to include a student representative. [Action]
9. Development & Alumni Relations Office (DARO)
The Director of DARO, David Street, presented a review of progress for 2014/15 including its recent restructuring; a change in its focus to major gift fundraising and alumni and DAROs comparative costs and income. Council congratulated David and his team on progress made. The following points were noted:

- The annual fund campaign had ceased because of cost but this would be reviewed. [Action]
- The aim was to move from income £3.5M per annum (most of which would continue annually) to £5M.
- A member asked whether there was an opportunity to link a major campaign to a significant event, theme or anniversary.
- The Director of DARO would explore gathering comparative data for University of London Colleges and report back. [Action]
- The Director of DARO would meet with Andrew Halper to discuss China and its approach to alumni engagement. [Action]
- Council congratulated David and his team on progress made and noted that the next DARO presentation would be given at the May 2016 Council meeting.

10. International
This item would be considered by Council on 10th July 2015.

11. Organisational Development Framework
Council considered the Organisational Development Framework, developed in 2014 which groups together a range of projects and initiatives under the broad headings of leadership engagement, internal communications and the staff experience. In discussion the following points were noted:

- The Framework had emerged from an action plan in response to the 2013 Staff Survey and was developed with the help of focus groups, trade unions and consultative groups.
- Council shared Senate’s and the Executive’s concern that the University had not received Athena SWAN accreditation. Council saw the Organisational Development Framework as a very useful tool and encouraged the Executive to continue to prioritise and put energy behind the initiative.
- The Chair questioned why the status of 3.5.2 “Consideration of positive action in all appropriate recruitment processes” was “On-hold” and the PVC (S&P) confirmed that this did not indicate that it would not happen but that it was flagged as a difficult issue. The Chair suggested a re-think of the choice of language so as not to mislead. [Action] The PVC (S&P) confirmed that ExCo had ultimate ownership of the initiative and it would take each hub in turn and assess progress, hence ExCo’s position in the centre of the “cake” diagram.
- The Dean of Cass noted the volume of work being done “bottom up” and also the Cass female colleagues network.
- A member of Council challenged ExCo members to think through how much the ODF had changed the way they approached their week at work.

The Chair of the Strategy, Implementation and Performance Committee (SIPCo), Kieran Murphy, gave a verbal report of the work undertaken by the Committee over the past year. In discussion the following points were noted:
• SIPCo’s aim was to assist the Executive to prepare for Council by acting as an informed, friendly but challenging forum on such issues as the REF, NSS, and KPI/PI and work stream progress. It also had the time to review in more detail for Council – the financial forecasts and plans and capex decisions.
• SIPCo had exercised its delegated power to approve the Annual Transparency Return (TRAC) to HEFCE.
• SIPCo also agreed the broad terms of the lease of Bath Street to Moorfields using exceptional delegated power from Council.
• The Terms of Reference for the Committee had been extended this year to allow the committee to provide advice on the development of the New Vision and Strategy 2026, and in view of this new responsibility, all members of Council were invited to attend SIPCo meetings should they wish to contribute to discussions.
• The Chair of SIPCo suggested that the Sebastian Street development and the issue of space for the City Law School should be considered as separate issues. City Law School was a relatively small School with low profitability and a limited ability to grow. SIPCo would receive an update on the Sebastian Street project at its next meeting with a recommendation for next steps.
• Andy Friend would take over as Chair of the Committee in August 2015 when Kieran Murphy’s term of office as a Council Member ends.

13. Strategic Planning

13.1 Strategy Implementation Progress Report
Council received the biannual progress report and in discussion the following points were noted:
• The current progress within three overarching Work Streams: Education & Student Strategy, Academic Excellence and Research & Enterprise. Council noted some of the significant challenges and risks to the delivery of several of the projects.
• The report was in a new format which was simplified and easier for Council to challenge if there was no progress.

13.2 Vision and Strategy 2026
Council received an update on progress following early staff engagement open sessions and further details on plans for the coming months to create the University’s Vision & Strategy 2026. In discussion the following points were noted:
• The early stages of the process aimed to engage staff. The themes that emerged then needed to be tested, analysed and hard choices made. There was conflict between these two approaches and it was important that the outcome from the overall process enabled staff to feel engaged and to own the final Vision & Strategy 2026.
• The aim was to have a draft Strategy and the direction of travel for the October 2015 Council meeting.
• It was stressed that this was still at the early stage and that SIPCo and Council would have a large input towards the process at a later stage.
• The ODF “Cake” diagram illustrated the visibility and involvement of staff in the planning process.
• The Chair noted the CUC discussions and the development of the Strategic Plan as an opportunity to involve external stakeholders and local businesses in the process. The way in which the Executive approach this should be considered at a later stage.
• The Chair of SIPCo noted the need to get academic engagement and also an indication of what the sector would do and look like in the future. It was
anticipated that if the University joined the University of London this would be helpful in gathering better information about the sector.

Council noted an update on the Revised Forecast 2014/15 and Draft Budget 2015/16 and in discussion the following points were noted:
- The Revised Forecast showed a surplus of £1M. The Draft Budget for 2015/16 indicated a surplus of £5.9M, which was 2.6% of the forecast income.
- The Finance Team would extend the financial planning to 2017/18 to enable submission to HEFCE by the end of July 2015.
- The University had established a link between City Postgraduate students and “Future Finance” who provide specialist student loans.
- Council acknowledged the progress that had been made to date and were pleased at the efforts to make staff more aware of the University’s financial position.
- The CFO would have the full support of Council in order to reach the financial goals set.

15. **Signalling**
Council received a paper on the benefits realisation work giving information on the benefits realisation modelling and estimated quantification of benefits. In discussion the following points were noted:
- This would be kept under annual review to assess the position compared to the suggested benefits outlined in the paper. [Action]
- It was suggested that the Executive should simplify the paper as much as possible.

16. **Arts and Social Sciences**
Council considered a recommendation from Senate (agreed at its meeting on 6th May) proposing a restructure within the School of Arts and Social Sciences.

**Decision**
Council approved Senate’s recommendation that the Culture and Creative Industries department in the School of Arts & Social Science would cease to be a department and Music be re-established as a department. Council noted that the label “Culture and Creative Industries” was still important from a marketing perspective and the University delivered a MA with this title.

**Part Three – Other Items for Decision without Discussion**

*Members noted they should star an item in this section if the wished it to be discussed.*

17. **Register of Collaborative Provision**
Council noted the register.

18. **Code on Freedom of Speech for meetings or other activities on University Premises**
Council received the Code on Freedom of Speech for information.

19. **Council and its Committees’ Meeting Dates**
Council noted the meeting dates.

20. **Minutes for Note**
20.1 Strategy, Implementation and Performance Committee  
23rd April 2015

20.2 Remuneration Committee, 29th April 2015

20.3 Senate highlights report from 6th May 2015

21. University Events
  Council noted the list of upcoming events.

22. FOI Review
  Council agreed the open/closed/restricted classification of items for the meeting as set out in the agenda.

23. Date of Next Meeting
  Friday 10th July 2015.

  The message setting out highlights from this Council meeting would be circulated to staff today.

**Part Five – Short Meeting of Independent Members**

24. Short Meeting of Independent Members
  There was a short meeting of the Independent Members, which was not minuted.

Rob Woodward
Pro-Chancellor and Chair of Council, June 2015