Council agreed the highlighted items and agreed to star Item 20, External Auditors Re-appointment.
Item 11, Internationalisation Strategy, was postponed to the February meeting to enable the VP, International, to present the item in person.

2. Minutes
The minutes of the meeting held on 7th October 2016 were approved.

3. Matters Arising
Council noted the table of actions arising from past meetings.

Action 10, Item 15B, DARO - the Director of DARO, David Street had discussed fundraising strategy further since the last meeting of Council with Dame Lynne Brindley, Dr John Low and Ron Zeghibe. A one-off round table discussion would be organised which would be attended by the Chair, President, lay members of Council who had met with David Street, Deans of Cass and City Law School and David. Once a date was finalised it would be circulated to all lay members who were welcome to attend. [Action]

4. Conflicts of Interest
There were no conflicts of interest.

5. Items Specially Brought Forward by the Chair
- The Chair noted that on this occasion the Council papers were far too long and that there was consequently a risk that important material might not be properly absorbed by lay members of Council. The Chair and the College Secretary, along with Adrian Haxby, would report back to the next meeting of Council on ways in which this problem could be tackled. [Action]
- The Chair thanked Professor Andrew Jones and Sharon Page for their excellent presentation at the Council Plenary dinner. The presentation would be circulated to those members who had been unable to attend. [Action]
- A further constructive meeting had taken place with students this term. The feedback continued to be positive especially with regard to Council’s commitment to the wellbeing of students and desire to engage with them.
- The meeting with staff representatives, this term with Trade Union representatives, had also taken place. Equality and diversity and Athena SWAN had been the focus of the discussion. Those present had all recognised that the Executive had taken the development of the Athena SWAN application extremely seriously. Questions had also been raised about the payment of the London Living Wage to staff by City’s contractors and would be followed up.
- City was one of 16 institutions invited by the Leadership Foundation to participate in an exercise to baseline current approaches to academic governance. The College Secretary would lead on this work and would be seeking assistance from lay members of Council, the Executive and other colleagues.
- A Private Bill that would enable University of London Colleges to apply for University title would be presented to Parliament on 28th November. City would need to decide in the spring if it wished to apply for University title.
- The Chair had attended the Committee of University Chairs’ (CUC’s) Autumn Plenary meeting in October. HEFCE had reported that every University in the UK was planning for growth, but that growth in the sector as a whole would be much less than the growth forecast by the combined plans of HEIs.
- The Chair thanked all members of Council for their participation in the Council Effectiveness Review. Minerva would report their findings to Council at the February Away Day.
6. **Council Calendar**

Council noted the rolling Council Calendar. In discussion it was noted that the Away Day in February would begin with a “business session” to include consideration of the International Strategy. The rest of the day would focus on academic governance and the items under section 10, followed by a debate around the Council Effectiveness Review led by Minerva. This would be followed by a tour of the upgraded estate including the new underground lecture theatre. Time permitting there would be a School Visit and presentation from one of the Deans. The President suggested that the new Dean of Arts and Social Sciences, Professor Theo Farrell, be invited to host this section of the Away Day. [Action]

7. **President’s Report**

The President highlighted several items from his report. In discussion the following points were noted:

- City’s certificate of accession to the University of London had been presented to the Chair and the President by the Chancellor of the University of London and was viewed by Council.
- An ExCo Away Day, dedicated to effective implementation of the Vision & Strategy 2026 was scheduled for January 2017.
- City’s undergraduate entry tariff had been rising from its long-term position of around 320, it reached 381 in 2015 and is likely to increase further with its 2016 entry.
- City was ranked 1st in London (7th in the UK) for sustainability in this year’s People & Planet University rankings. PAF were congratulated for successfully leading on this initiative.
- After six successful years as VP (Strategy & Planning), Professor Richard Verrall’s term would come to an end next year and he would resume his academic career at Cass; Professor Stanton Newman had decided to stand down as Dean of the School of Health Sciences next summer but would continue part-time as VP (International).
- City was ranked equal 12th in the UK (with Leeds) in the new Times Higher Global University Employability ranking.
- The Main Entrance Project was nearing completion and a maquette of the sculpture proposed for the front entrance was viewed by Council.
- Cass had improved its position in recent Financial Times MBA and The Economist “Which MBA?” rankings.
- For the Law School, new consultation papers from the Bar Standards Board and the Solicitors Regulation Authority had provided more detail on the likely direction of future professional regulation. As a result, the School was now in a better position to consider the redesign of its programmes in the context of the Vision & Strategy 2026; Integration of the City Law School was underway, ahead of the move to Sebastian Street.
- For the School of Health Sciences, the big issue was the move from bursaries to loans for students which had generated an uncertain market for 2016/17. The School was reviewing areas where it could increase student numbers and the resources required to support such growth. A new study by the Natural History Museum and Professor Ron Douglas in the SHS Optometry Division had analysed the genes involved in snake vision to understand better how snake sight evolved.
- The School of Mathematics, Computer Science and Engineering had welcomed its first intake of students for new engineering degrees.
- In the School of Arts & Social Sciences, Professors Ronen Palan, Anastasia Nesvetailova, Richard Murphy and Dr Christopher Gandrud had been awarded...
an ECR Advanced Grant for 1,739,387 euros for a project on corporate arbitrage. This was City’s first ECR award.

8 President of the Students’ Union Report
The SU President highlighted items from his report. In discussion the following points were noted:

- The issues identified in the report arising from the closure of Level 3 in the Library had been resolved, following a meeting with the Librarian.
- The SU was working with the Executive to identify a space for the Graduate Library.
- The SU was running a survey on food available on campus to produce recommendations for consideration by Sodexo (City’s catering provider).
- The Union Support Service continued to do much good work with students and the SU was in the early stages of work to extend its Support Service.
- There were now 93 student societies, the highest in the SU’s history.
- The SU had held its Annual General Meeting (AGM) on Thursday 17th November with 182 students in attendance, the highest number in recent years.

Part Two – Major Items for Discussion or Decision

9. HEFCE Assurance Statement on Prevent
Council considered a progress report on the Prevent Duty Implementation along with the Prevent Duty Monitoring Annual Report 2015/16. In discussion the following points were noted:

- The SU President noted that the SU would like City to adopt a ‘minimal compliance’ response to its Prevent duties and that it would like to see the issue of “Islamophobia” addressed in the Prevent training across the institution.
- Council agreed that it would find it useful to be updated on Prevent throughout the year rather than simply receiving an end of year progress/update report. The VP, R&E, noted that the next update would be provided to Council in May when the training was underway. [Action]

Decision
Council approved the Prevent Annual Report and Risk Assessment for submission to HEFCE.

10 HEFCE Assurance Statement on the Student Academic Experience and Outcomes and Setting and Maintaining Academic Standards

10.1 Council Annual Assurance Statement to HEFCE on Academic Quality and Standards
Council received the paper which gave details of HEFCE’s requirement that Governing bodies of Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) should send it an assurance statement on academic quality and standards this year by 1st December. The paper also provided details of the evidence and processes available to Council as it considered its annual assurance statement.

Council noted that additional processes would be developed to support the additional assurance statement required for 2017 and this would be further discussed at the Away Day in February 2017.

Decision
Council agreed that a full Assurance Statement should be signed off and sent to HEFCE by 1st December 2016.
10.2 Senate Annual Assurance Report to Council
Council received the third Annual Assurance Report from Senate to Council which provided an overview of issues related to quality and standards that are delegated to Senate by Council. In discussion it was noted that this report was required as part of the Council Annual Assurance Statement to HEFCE (at 10.1).

**Decision**
Council approved the Senate Annual Assurance Report for 2015/16.

10.3 Quality and Standards Action Plan 2016/17
Council noted the Quality and Standards Action Plan which set out the institutional level work to be undertaken during 2016/17 relating to the continuous improvement of the student academic experience and student outcomes. In discussion, it was noted that the actions in the plan were not ascribed to individuals, but the Deputy President & Provost noted there was ownership of each action at City and this was made clear in more detailed plans drawn up by the Executive to manage this work.

10.4 Future reporting to Council on Assurance of Academic Quality and Standards
Council considered a paper which advised Council on the proposed future approach to annual reporting on assurance of academic quality and standards in relation to the new HEFCE Revised Model for Quality Assessment. In discussion the following points were noted:

- The role of the system of external examiners and of peer review more generally was critical in ensuring consistency in setting and maintaining academic standards across the HEI sector. It would be helpful, however, for lay members of Council to understand more clearly the basis on which standards were set and maintained at City; and the background against which the legal profession had recently concluded there was considerable disparity between the degrees awarded by different institutions.
- Changes to the format of Senate’s reporting to Council and to Senate’s consideration of the areas covered in Council’s assurance statement to HEFCE, might well be required in 2016/17. Wider changes might also be required at City to reflect the more outcome-oriented focus of the assurance requirement from HEFCE and the introduction of the TEF.
- City would need to strike the right balance between work to assure standards and quality in Schools on the one hand and innovation on the other.
- City should learn from other institutions where this was possible, but City seemed to be as far advanced as any institution in thinking about these issues.
- There would be further discussion of the issues at the Council Away Day in February. An agenda for the Away Day should be developed well in advance and should include coverage of the TEF and the Annual Provider Review. Minerva’s report on the effectiveness of Council and its Committees should also feed into the discussion of this topic at the Away Day.
- Members were asked to consider what aspects of assurance, from a Council perspective, they would like to have more information and debate on then feedback to the Chair and College Secretary in the next few weeks. [Action]

11. Internationalisation Strategy
*This item was deferred to the meeting in February 2017.*
12. **Health & Safety Report**

Council noted the Annual Health & Safety Report which was presented to the Audit and Risk Committee on 7th November. The report summarised City’s Health & Safety performance for the academic year 2015/16. In discussion the following points were noted:

- The main focus over the previous year had been on the School of Mathematics, Computer Science & Engineering (SMCSE) and the Chair of ARC noted that the biggest issue had been around the capacity of the central team to give guidance to the School and this was now being addressed. The School would have the services and direction of a dedicated Health & Safety Professional who would work alongside the Dean and colleagues in 2017. That post holder would report to the President via the Chair of Health & Safety Committee. The Dean of SMCSE would be invited back to a future ARC meeting to provide an update and progress report.

- A Health & Safety Audit of the School of Health had taken place in October 13th and the Audit Team was led by Nigel Maxwell-Smith, Interim Health & Safety Manager. Once the report of the Audit had been forwarded to the School for comment it would be released to Internal Audit and the recommendations would be added to the Safety Office’s tracking system. The School would be revisited in March 2017 to check implementation of the recommendations.

13. **HR Annual Report**

Council received the HR Annual Report which provided a briefing on the HR Directorate’s key activities and achievements during 2015/16. The report also provided the annual report to Council summarising the number and types of grievances raised formally during 2015/16. In discussion it was noted that one measure of the success of HR function would be the findings of the Staff Survey which closes on 2nd December. A report on the findings would be presented to Council at the March 2017 meeting.

14. **Athena SWAN Application**

Council members noted the final application (reflecting feedback from Council), and the Action Plan, for the Athena SWAN Bronze award. The application would be presented at the Executive Committee for approval on the 29th November and submitted to the Equality Challenge Unit on the 30th November.

15. **Finance**

15.1 **Audit and Risk Committee Annual Report**

Council received the Audit and Risk Committee (ARC) annual report for 2015/16 which was presented by the Chair of ARC. ARC gave Council assurance that City’s arrangements for risk management, control, governance, value for money and management & quality assurance of data submitted to HESA and HEFCE were Adequate and Effective. Where there were issues, they were not material to this judgment and they were in the process of being addressed. In discussion the following points were noted:

- Business Continuity Management would be the next big focus for ARC and the responsible officer had been invited to attend the next meeting to provide the Committee with an update.
- The Value for Money (VfM) Report this year was much more comprehensive than in previous years. In the opinion of ARC VfM was now taken far more seriously and was better managed. ARC would however like to see VfM more broadly embedded into the audit process moving forward.
• The Chair of ARC thanked the ARC Members for their vast contribution to the work of the Committee.

15.2 CFO’s Strategic Report on the Financial Statements
Council received the CFO’s strategic report on the Financial Statements. The following points were noted:
• This was the first published set of financial statements prepared in accordance with the Statement of Recommended Practice (SORP): “Accounting for further and Higher Education 2015” and in accordance with Financial Reporting Standard (FRS) 102.
• As a result of unrealised surplus on revaluation of Land and Buildings and actuarial loss in respect of Pension Schemes, the total Comprehensive Income for the year moved from £11.1M to £7.1M.

15.3 Financial Statements 2015/16
Council received the Financial Statements including the Governance Statement of responsibilities of City’s Council.

Decision
Council approved the Financial Statements for 2015/16 which would be signed by the Chair and the President.

15.4 Student Recruitment 2016 Flash Financial Forecast
Council received a verbal update from the CFO noting that City was currently on track financially.

15.5 Institutional Sustainability
Council received the Annual Sustainability Assurance Report, which formed a part of the annual accountability returns to HEFCE and covered financial performance, financial sustainability, risk management, control and governance, Value for Money, the management and quality assurance of data and opportunities and challenges for institutions.

Decision
Council approved the Annual Sustainability Assurance Report which would be signed by the Chair.

15.6 Investments Report
Council noted the Investments Report which provided an update on investment management and performance for 2015/16 year end and up to 31st October 2016. Council noted an update on the process to select and appoint a single Investments Manager. 
This item is continued in Section B of the Minutes, Closed Business.

15.7 Report from EY
Council noted a paper from City’s Financial Advisor, EY. 
This item is continued in Section B of the Minutes, Closed Business.

16. University Level Risk Review
Council considered the biannual review of City’s Risk Register. In discussion the following points were noted:
• An adjustment to the impact scoring had been discussed at the meeting of the Audit and Risk Committee on 7th March 2016 and implemented as part of the review. This helped to separate the higher post-control risks from the other
institutional risks. Risks arising from Brexit were now included in the Risk Register.

- The Chair of ARC noted that the extent of City’s Risk Appetite would be considered again by ARC when the new risk register was further debated at future meetings. ARC would also consider, at a future meeting, whether a ‘red’ post control rating for Health & Safety remained appropriate. [Action]

17. Biannual KPI/PI Report
Council received a report on City’s performance against the KPIs/PIs and Strategic Plan 2012 milestones, which had been reported biannually to Council. It was noted that arrangements for reporting Vision & Strategy 2026 performance would be discussed by the Strategy Implementation & Performance Committee in January 2017.

18. Committee Matters

18.1 Appointment of New Council Members
Council approved the following new appointments:
(i) Professor Christopher Jenks for a 3 year term of office commencing on 1st January 2017.

18.2 Reappointment of Council Members
Council approved the following renewals of Membership:
(i) Dame Lynne Brindley for a further 3 years ending on 31st January 2020.
(ii) Dr John Low for a further 3 years ending on 31st January 2020.

18.3 Ordinances
Council approved recommendations from CGNC on revisions to the following Ordinances:
(i) C1. - Senate (revision to the ordinance to reflect Council’s new responsibility for academic quality and standards).
(ii) C5. - SIPCo Terms of Reference (revision to reflect its responsibilities for monitoring implementation of the Strategy 2026 and School plans; now up to 4 independent Council Members rather than 6; inclusion of an invitation to all members who wish to attend).
(iii) D2. - Appointment of Council Members (addition of a statement on quality and diversity).

Council noted an amendment to the following Ordinance:
(iv) D6. – Meetings (to reflect that Council and its Committees should be able to take decisions by correspondence if required).

Part Three – Other Items for Decision without Discussion

19. Letter of Representation
Council approved the Letter of Representation to be signed by the Chair, President and Chief Financial Officer following the meeting.

20. External Auditors Re-appointment
Council approved the re-appointment of KPMG to act as External Auditors for 2016/17. The CFO would start the selection process for new External Auditors in the spring.
21. **HEFCE Annual Accountability Returns**

21.1 **Designated Officer’s Annual Assurance Return (Annex A)**

Council approved the return.

21.2 **Delegation to the President**

Council agreed to delegate to the President final sign-off of the Annual Accountability Returns to HEFCE.

*Part Four – Items for Information*

22. **Minutes for Note**

22.1 Senate, 12th October 2016
22.2 Corporate Governance & Nominations Committee, 10th October 2016
22.3 Remuneration Committee, 20th October 2016
22.4 Audit & Risk Committee, 7th November 2016

23. **Value for Money Annual Report**

Council received the report.

24. **Register of Interests**

Council noted the register and would notify the Governance Team of any changes.

25. **University Events**

Council noted the upcoming events.

26. **FOI Review**

Council agreed that no alterations were required.

*Secretary’s note: Following the meeting, the VP (S&P) requested that the paper for Item 14, Athena Swan Application be reclassified as “closed”.*

27. **Date of Next Meeting**


*Part Five – Short Meeting of Independent Members*

28. **Short Meeting of Independent Members**

There was a short meeting of the Independent Members, which was not minuted.

Rob Woodward
Chair of Council
December 2016